



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

Applies to all products administered or underwritten by Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana and its subsidiary, HMO Louisiana, Inc. (collectively referred to as the "Company"), unless otherwise provided in the applicable contract. Medical technology is constantly evolving, and we reserve the right to review and update Medical Policy periodically.

Note: Autologous Chondrocyte Implantation for Focal Articular Cartilage Lesions is addressed separately in medical policy 00006.

Note: Autografts and Allografts in the Treatment of Focal Articular Cartilage Lesions is addressed separately in medical policy 00091.

Services Are Considered Investigational

Coverage is not available for investigational medical treatments or procedures, drugs, devices or biological products.

Based on review of available data, the Company considers synthetic cartilage implants for the treatment of articular cartilage damage to be **investigational**.*

Background/Overview

Articular Cartilage Damage

Articular cartilage damage may present as focal lesions or as more diffuse osteoarthritis. Cartilage is a biological hydrogel that is comprised mostly of water with collagen and glycosaminoglycans and does not typically heal on its own. Osteoarthritis or focal articular cartilage lesions can be associated with substantial pain, loss of function, and disability. Osteoarthritis is most frequently observed in the knees, hips, interphalangeal joints, first carpometacarpal joints, first metatarsophalangeal (MTP) joint, and apophyseal (facet) joints of the lower cervical and lower lumbar spine. Osteoarthritis less commonly affects the elbow, wrist, shoulder, and ankle. Knee osteoarthritis is the most common cause of lower-limb disability in adults over age 50, however, osteoarthritis of the MTP joint with loss of motion (hallux rigidus) can also be severely disabling due to pain in the "toe-off" position of gait. An epidemiologic study found that osteoarthritis of the first MTP joint may be present in as many as 1 in 40 people over the age of 50.

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

Treatment

Treatment may include debridement, abrasion techniques, osteochondral autografting, and autologous chondrocyte implantation. Debridement involves the removal of the synovial membrane, osteophytes, loose articular debris, and diseased cartilage and is capable of producing symptomatic relief. Subchondral abrasion techniques attempt to restore the articular surface by inducing the growth of fibrocartilage into the chondral defect. Diffuse osteoarthritis of the knee, hip, shoulder or ankle may be treated with joint replacement.

Early-stage osteoarthritis of the first MTP joint is typically treated with conservative management, including pain medication and change in footwear. Failure of conservative management in patients with advanced osteoarthritis of the MTP joint may be treated surgically. Cheilectomy (removal of bone osteophytes) and interpositional spacers with autograft or allograft have been used as temporary measures to relieve pain.

Although partial or total joint replacement have been explored for MTP osteoarthritis, complications from bone loss, loosening, wear debris, implant fragmentation, and transfer metatarsalgia are not uncommon. Also, since the conversion of a failed joint replacement to arthrodesis has greater complications and worse functional results than a primary arthrodesis (joint fusion), MTP arthrodesis is considered the most reliable and primary surgical option. Arthrodesis can lead to a pain-free foot, but the loss of mobility in the MTP joint alters gait, may restrict participation in running and other sports, and limits footwear options, leading to patient dissatisfaction. Transfer of stress and arthritis in an adjacent joint may also develop over time.

Because of the limitations of MTP arthrodesis, alternative treatments that preserve joint motion are being explored. Synthetic cartilage implants have been investigated as a means to reduce pain and improve function in patients with hallux rigidus. Some materials such as silastic were found to fragment with use. Other causes of poor performance are the same as those observed with metal and ceramic joint replacement materials and include dislocation, particle wear, osteolysis, and loosening.

Synthetic polyvinyl alcohol (PVA) hydrogels have water content and biomechanical properties similar to cartilage and they are biocompatible. Polyvinyl alcohol hydrogels have been used in a variety of medical products including soft contact lens, artificial tears, hydrophilic nerve guides, and tissue adhesion barriers. This material is being evaluated for cartilage replacement due to the rubber

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

elastic properties and, depending on the manufacturing process, high tensile strength and compressibility.

The Cartiva implant is an 8- to 10 mm PVA disc that is implanted with a slight protrusion to act as a spacer for the first MTP joint. It comes with dedicated reusable instrumentation, which includes a drill bit, introducer, and placer.

FDA or Other Governmental Regulatory Approval

U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA)

The Cartiva PVA implant was approved by the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) in 2016 for the treatment of arthritis of the MTP joint. It has been distributed commercially since 2002 with approval in Europe, Canada, and Brazil. The Cartiva^{®†} Synthetic Cartilage Implant (Wright Medical, Alpharetta, GA) was approved by the FDA through the premarket approval process (P150017) for painful degenerative or posttraumatic arthritis in the first MTP joint along with hallux valgus or hallux limitus and hallux rigidus. Lesions greater than 10 mm in size and insufficient quality or quantity of bone are contraindications. Continued approval depends on a study evaluating long-term safety and effectiveness. The post-approval study will follow the subjects treated with Cartiva Synthetic Cartilage Implant for 5 years. FDA product code: PNW.

Rationale/Source

This medical policy was developed through consideration of peer-reviewed medical literature generally recognized by the relevant medical community, U.S. Food and Drug Administration approval status, nationally accepted standards of medical practice and accepted standards of medical practice in this community, technology evaluation centers, reference to federal regulations, other plan medical policies, and accredited national guidelines.

Articular cartilage damage, either from a focal lesion or diffuse osteoarthritis (OA), can result in disabling pain. Cartilage is a hydrogel, comprised mostly of water with collagen and glycosaminoglycans, that does not typically heal on its own. There is a need for improved treatment options. In 2016, a synthetic polyvinyl alcohol hydrogel disc received marketing approval by the U.S. Food and Drug Administration for the treatment of degenerative or posttraumatic arthritis in the first metatarsophalangeal (MTP) joint. If proven successful for the treatment of the MTP joint, off-label use is likely.

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

For individuals who have early-stage first MTP joint OA who receive a synthetic cartilage implant, the evidence is lacking. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. The pivotal study was performed in patients with Coughlin stage 2, 3, or 4 hallux rigidus. No evidence was identified in patients with stage 0 to early-stage 2 hallux rigidus. The evidence is insufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

For individuals who have advanced first MTP joint OA who receive a synthetic cartilage implant, the evidence includes a pivotal non-inferiority trial. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. Arthrodesis is the established treatment for advanced arthritis of the great toe, although the lack of mobility can negatively impact sports and choice of footwear, and is not a preferred option of patients. Implants have the potential to reduce pain and maintain mobility in the first MTP joint but have in the past been compromised by fragmentation, dislocation, particle wear, osteolysis, and loosening. A polyvinyl alcohol hydrogel implant has shown properties similar to articular cartilage in vitro and was approved by the U.S. FDA in 2016 for the treatment of painful degenerative or post-traumatic arthritis in the MTP joint. Results at 2 years from the pivotal non-inferiority trial showed pain scores that were slightly worse compared to patients treated with arthrodesis and similar outcomes between the groups for ADL and sports. In a non-inferiority trial, some benefit should be observed to justify the non-inferiority margin. However, the benefit of Cartiva with respect to increased range of motion does not appear to translate to improved ADL, sports activities, or patient report of well-being compared to arthrodesis. In addition, the Cartiva group showed a higher rate of adverse outcomes (Moderate Difficulty, Extreme Difficulty, and Unable to Do) compared to the arthrodesis group for walking for 15 min (16% vs. 0%), Up Stairs (6% vs. 0%) and Squats (19% vs. 8%). Some bias in favor of the novel motion preserving implant was also possible, as suggested by the high dropout rate in the arthrodesis group after randomization. Five-year follow-up of both the randomized and run-in patients who received an implant was reported in 2018 for 135 of 152 patients. At this time point, 21% of implants had been removed with conversion to arthrodesis. Comparison to arthrodesis at long-term follow-up is needed to determine whether the implant improves function. Corroboration of long-term results in an independent study is also needed to determine the benefits and risks of the implant. The evidence is insufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

For individuals who have articular cartilage damage in joints other than the great toe who receive a synthetic cartilage implant, the evidence includes observational studies. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. No RCTs were identified. The evidence is insufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

Supplemental Information

Practice Guidelines and Position Statements

Guidelines or position statements will be considered for inclusion in 'Supplemental Information' if they were issued by, or jointly by, a US professional society, an international society with US representation, or National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). Priority will be given to guidelines that are informed by a systematic review, include strength of evidence ratings, and include a description of management of conflict of interest.

No guidelines or statements were identified.

U.S. Preventive Services Task Force Recommendations

Not applicable.

Medicare National Coverage

There is no national coverage determination. In the absence of a national coverage determination, coverage decisions are left to the discretion of local Medicare carriers.

Ongoing and Unpublished Clinical Trials

Some currently ongoing and unpublished trials that might influence this review are listed in Table 1.



Louisiana

Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

Table 1. Summary of Key Trials

NCT No.	Trial Name	Planned Enrollment	Completion Date
<i>Ongoing</i>			
NCT03247439 ^a	A Prospective Study to Evaluate the Safety and Effectiveness of the Cartiva ^{®†} Synthetic Cartilage Implant for CMC in the Treatment of First Carpometacarpal Joint Osteoarthritis as Compared to Ligament Reconstruction Tendon Interposition (LRTI) Comparator (GRIP2)	74	Mar 2024
<i>Unpublished</i>			
NCT02391506 ^a	A Prospective Study to Evaluate the Safety and Effectiveness of the Cartiva ^{®†} Synthetic Cartilage Implant for CMC in the Treatment of First Carpometacarpal Joint Osteoarthritis	50	Mar 2019
NCT03935880	Treatment of Hallux Rigidus With Synthetic Hemiarthroplasty Versus Cheilectomy: A Randomized Controlled Trial	22	Sept 2021 (terminated due to difficulty meeting recruitment goals)

NCT: national clinical trial.

^aDenotes industry-sponsored or cosponsored trial.

References

1. Gould N, Schneider W, Ashikaga T. Epidemiological survey of foot problems in the continental United States: 1978-1979. Foot Ankle. Jul 1980; 1(1): 8-10. PMID 6115797

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

2. Baker MI, Walsh SP, Schwartz Z, et al. A review of polyvinyl alcohol and its uses in cartilage and orthopedic applications. J Biomed Mater Res B Appl Biomater. Jul 2012; 100(5): 1451-7. PMID 22514196
3. Baumhauer JF, Singh D, Glazebrook M, et al. Prospective, Randomized, Multi-centered Clinical Trial Assessing Safety and Efficacy of a Synthetic Cartilage Implant Versus First Metatarsophalangeal Arthrodesis in Advanced Hallux Rigidus. Foot Ankle Int. May 2016; 37(5): 457-69. PMID 26922669
4. Smyth NA, Murawski CD, Hannon CP, et al. The Use of a Synthetic Cartilage Implant for Hallux Rigidus: A Systematic Review. Foot Ankle Spec. Jul 03 2020: 1938640020937160. PMID 32618201
5. Cassinelli SJ, Chen S, Charlton TP, et al. Early Outcomes and Complications of Synthetic Cartilage Implant for Treatment of Hallux Rigidus in the United States. Foot Ankle Int. Oct 2019; 40(10): 1140-1148. PMID 31195830
6. U.S. Food and Drug Administration. Cartiva: Summary of Safety and Effectiveness. 2016; https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/cdrh_docs/pdf15/p150017b.pdf
7. Glazebrook M, Younger ASE, Daniels TR, et al. Treatment of first metatarsophalangeal joint arthritis using hemiarthroplasty with a synthetic cartilage implant or arthrodesis: A comparison of operative and recovery time. Foot Ankle Surg. Oct 2018; 24(5): 440-447. PMID 29409199
8. Goldberg A, Singh D, Glazebrook M, et al. Association Between Patient Factors and Outcome of Synthetic Cartilage Implant Hemiarthroplasty vs First Metatarsophalangeal Joint Arthrodesis in Advanced Hallux Rigidus. Foot Ankle Int. Nov 2017; 38(11): 1199-1206. PMID 28820949
9. Baumhauer JF, Singh D, Glazebrook M, et al. Correlation of Hallux Rigidus Grade With Motion, VAS Pain, Intraoperative Cartilage Loss, and Treatment Success for First MTP Joint Arthrodesis and Synthetic Cartilage Implant. Foot Ankle Int. Nov 2017; 38(11): 1175-1182. PMID 28992721
10. U.S. Food and Drug Administration. Cartiva: Post approval studies. 2016; https://www.accessdata.fda.gov/scripts/cdrh/cfdocs/cfpma/pma_pas.cfm?c_id=4019&t_id=570803.
11. Glazebrook M, Blundell CM, O'Dowd D, et al. Midterm Outcomes of a Synthetic Cartilage Implant for the First Metatarsophalangeal Joint in Advanced Hallux Rigidus. Foot Ankle Int. Apr 2019; 40(4): 374-383. PMID 30501401
12. Joo PY, Baumhauer JF, Waldman O, et al. Physical Function and Pain Interference Levels of Hallux Rigidus Patients Before and After Synthetic Cartilage Implant vs Arthrodesis Surgery. Foot Ankle Int. May 24 2021: 10711007211007843. PMID 34024138

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

13. An TW, Cassinelli S, Charlton TP, et al. Radiographic and Magnetic Resonance Imaging of the Symptomatic Synthetic Cartilage Implant. *Foot Ankle Int.* Jan 2020; 41(1): 25-30. PMID 31538827
14. Shi E, Todd N, Rush S, et al. First Metatarsophalangeal Joint Space Area Decreases Within 1 Month After Implantation of a Polyvinyl Alcohol Hydrogel Implant: A Retrospective Radiographic Case Series. *J Foot Ankle Surg.* Nov 2019; 58(6): 1288-1292. PMID 31679683
15. Metikala S, Mahmoud K, O'Connor KM, et al. Adverse Events Related to Cartiva Hemiarthroplasty of First Metatarsal: An Analysis of Reports to the United States Food and Drug Administration. *Foot Ankle Spec.* Jul 29 2020: 1938640020943715. PMID 32723089
16. Glazebrook M, Baumhauer JF, Blundell C, et al. Letter Regarding: Early Outcomes and Complications of Synthetic Cartilage Implant for Treatment of Hallux Rigidus in the United States. *Foot Ankle Int.* Oct 2019; 40(10): 1149-1151. PMID 31600478
17. Thordarson DB, Cassinelli SJ, Charlton TP, et al. Response to "Letter Regarding: Early Outcomes and Complications of Synthetic Cartilage Implant for Treatment of Hallux Rigidus in the United States". *Foot Ankle Int.* Oct 2019; 40(10): 1152-1153. PMID 31600477

Policy History

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

03/01/2018	Medical Policy Committee review
03/21/2018	Medical Policy Implementation Committee approval. New policy.
03/07/2019	Medical Policy Committee review
03/20/2019	Medical Policy Implementation Committee approval. Coverage eligibility unchanged.
03/05/2020	Medical Policy Committee review
03/11/2020	Medical Policy Implementation Committee approval. Coverage eligibility unchanged.
03/04/2021	Medical Policy Committee review
03/10/2021	Medical Policy Implementation Committee approval. Coverage eligibility unchanged.
03/03/2022	Medical Policy Committee review
03/09/2022	Medical Policy Implementation Committee approval. Coverage eligibility unchanged.

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

03/02/2023 Medical Policy Committee review

03/08/2023 Medical Policy Implementation Committee approval. Coverage eligibility unchanged.

Next Scheduled Review Date: 03/2024

Coding

The five character codes included in the Blue Cross Blue Shield of Louisiana Medical Policy Coverage Guidelines are obtained from Current Procedural Terminology (CPT®)†, copyright 2022 by the American Medical Association (AMA). CPT is developed by the AMA as a listing of descriptive terms and five character identifying codes and modifiers for reporting medical services and procedures performed by physician.

The responsibility for the content of Blue Cross Blue Shield of Louisiana Medical Policy Coverage Guidelines is with Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana and no endorsement by the AMA is intended or should be implied. The AMA disclaims responsibility for any consequences or liability attributable or related to any use, nonuse or interpretation of information contained in Blue Cross Blue Shield of Louisiana Medical Policy Coverage Guidelines. Fee schedules, relative value units, conversion factors and/or related components are not assigned by the AMA, are not part of CPT, and the AMA is not recommending their use. The AMA does not directly or indirectly practice medicine or dispense medical services. The AMA assumes no liability for data contained or not contained herein. Any use of CPT outside of Blue Cross Blue Shield of Louisiana Medical Policy Coverage Guidelines should refer to the most current Current Procedural Terminology which contains the complete and most current listing of CPT codes and descriptive terms. Applicable FARS/DFARS apply.

CPT is a registered trademark of the American Medical Association.

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

Codes used to identify services associated with this policy may include (but may not be limited to) the following:

Code Type	Code
CPT	28291
HCPCS	L8641, L8642, L8699
ICD-10 Diagnosis	All related diagnoses

*Investigational – A medical treatment, procedure, drug, device, or biological product is Investigational if the effectiveness has not been clearly tested and it has not been incorporated into standard medical practice. Any determination we make that a medical treatment, procedure, drug, device, or biological product is Investigational will be based on a consideration of the following:

- A. Whether the medical treatment, procedure, drug, device, or biological product can be lawfully marketed without approval of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) and whether such approval has been granted at the time the medical treatment, procedure, drug, device, or biological product is sought to be furnished; or
- B. Whether the medical treatment, procedure, drug, device, or biological product requires further studies or clinical trials to determine its maximum tolerated dose, toxicity, safety, effectiveness, or effectiveness as compared with the standard means of treatment or diagnosis, must improve health outcomes, according to the consensus of opinion among experts as shown by reliable evidence, including:
 1. Consultation with technology evaluation center(s);
 2. Credible scientific evidence published in peer-reviewed medical literature generally recognized by the relevant medical community; or
 3. Reference to federal regulations.

‡ Indicated trademarks are the registered trademarks of their respective owners.

NOTICE: If the Patient's health insurance contract contains language that differs from the BCBSLA Medical Policy definition noted above, the definition in the health insurance contract will be relied upon for specific coverage determinations.

NOTICE: Medical Policies are scientific based opinions, provided solely for coverage and informational purposes. Medical Policies should not be construed to suggest that the Company

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.



Synthetic Cartilage Implants for Joint Pain

Policy # 00149

Original Effective Date: 06/01/2018

Current Effective Date: 04/10/2023

recommends, advocates, requires, encourages, or discourages any particular treatment, procedure, or service, or any particular course of treatment, procedure, or service.

©2023 Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana is an independent licensee of the Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association and incorporated as Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission from Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana.